Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement

Loutraki, Greece, 6-7 April 2017

Report of the Meeting
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Report of the meeting</td>
<td>1-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex II</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda of the Meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex III</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions and Recommendations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction

1. In accordance with the UNEP/MAP Programme of Work 2016-2017 adopted by COP 19, Athens, Greece, 9-12 February 2016, the Secretariat organized the Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement from 6 to 7 April 2017 in Greece.

2. The main objective of the meeting was to bring together national experts working in the environmental permitting and inspection systems to:

   a) review the proposed guides prepared by the Secretariat related to the application and selection of most adequate Best Available Technologies and related environmental inspection
   b) share best practices and recent developments related to the national environmental permitting, inspection and enforcement systems

Participation

3. The meeting was attended by representatives from the following Contracting Parties: Albania, Algeria, Bosnia & Herzegovina, Croatia, Cyprus, Egypt, Greece, Israel, Italy, Lebanon, Libya, Malta, Montenegro, Morocco, Slovenia, Turkey and the State of Palestine. The UNEP/MAP Secretariat was represented by the MAP Coordinating Unit and MED POL Programme. The meeting was also attended by representatives of the European Union Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Law (IMPEL) and the Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIO-ECSDE). The full list of participants is attached as Annex I to the present report.

Agenda item 1: Opening of the Meeting

4. The meeting was opened by Ms. Tatjana Hema, Deputy-Coordinator of MAP - Barcelona Convention Secretariat.

Agenda item 2: Adoption of the Agenda and Election of Officers

a) Adoption of the Agenda

5. The proposed Provisional agenda appearing in document UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/1, and its timetable was adopted and appears as Annex II to the present report.

b) Election of officers

6. In accordance with the Rules of procedures for meetings and conferences of the Contracting Parties, the meeting elected one (1) Chair, three (3) Vice-Chairs and one (1) Rapporteur from among the participants, as follows:

   Chair: Mr Georgios Melekis, Greece
   Vice-Chair: Mr Ali Elkekli, Libya
   Vice-Chair: Mr Jawad Benhmidane, Morocco,
   Vice-Chair: Mr. Boris Žbona, Slovenia
   Rapporteur: Ms. Ledjana Bojaxhi, Albania

Agenda item 3: Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region

a) State of play of National Inspection and Permitting Systems in place: success stories and barriers
b) Collaboration with relevant Compliance and Enforcement Networks  
c) Ways and means to promote Compliance and Enforcement  

7. All representatives of the Contracting Parties present at the meeting took the floor and introduced the most recent developments of the environmental inspection bodies and regulations in their countries. This session provided a great opportunity to briefly present the state of play of national inspection systems, and share concrete results regarding law implementation, success stories and challenges faced.

8. Mr Junker Harald, representative of IMPEL network made a presentation on the work carried at European level on issues related to environmental compliance and enforcement and informed a meeting on possible projects for collaboration.

9. Participants embarked on discussions with the view to propose concrete actions on ways and means to promote and enhance environmental law enforcement in the region in line with national legislation and obligations under the Barcelona Convention and its Protocols. In this respect the meeting highlighted that in spite of progress achieved and success stories, challenges are still considerable in particular related to a) insufficient human resources, b) needs for capacity building and enhancing technical competency of competent authorities in addressing both permitting and inspection and c) sharing best practices across the region and beyond.

10. The meeting recommended that the informal network on compliance and enforcement should provide more opportunities for the Contracting Parties and relevant organizations to work together to enhance environmental performance and effectiveness of national enforcement bodies within the scope of the MAP Programme of Work and highlighted the need for better collaboration with other enforcement networks such as IMPEL with the view to promote sharing of best practices and capacity building.

Agenda item 4: Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT)

11. The Secretariat with technical support from a regional expert, presented the draft Guides for the introduction and inspection of BAT implementation in industrial facilities, aiming to assist the permitting authorities of the Contracting Parties to extract and evaluate the necessary information contained in the complex literature in order to assess the information provided by the applicants for permits concerning BAT introduction in industrial installations and ensure that their application is effective. Some examples of inspection checklists will be also presented.

  a) Guide on the selection of Best Available Techniques in Industrial installations

12. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide and suggested minor changes to ensure further clarifications such as environmental quality standards.

13. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft guide to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance permitting process and competence of the national authorities ensuring that the proper BAT are selected by the operators/proponents.

14. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation and recommended the development of a number of case studies by the Secretariat (waste water including sludge management, landfill management, petroleum refinery (next biennium), offshore Industry (next biennium), electric arc furnace.
15. The Contracting Parties were encouraged to prepare and send to the Secretariat, as appropriate case studies on BAT assessment addressing different sectors with a particular focus on those affecting marine and coastal environment with the view to demonstrate and highlight the Mediterranean success stories and promoting and sharing best practices in the region.

b) Guide on Inspections of Industrial Facilities

16. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat and suggested some changes to ensure a better streamlining of the enforcement indicators already agreed in the framework of the MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean. It agreed to recommend the draft Guide to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance national environmental inspection performance.

17. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation including exchange of inspection officers between countries and recommended that countries should consider reporting in future meetings of MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean, data and assessment of the performance inspection indicators and as appropriate their trends during the last years.

18. The meeting suggested to gradually extend the scope of the work of this network that may consider inspection activities related to other source of pollution such as dumping, offshore, etc., and in particular, the interaction of pollution impacts with the protection of marine and coastal biodiversity and highlighted the need for enhanced visibility of the work undertaken by the network and dissemination of its products.

Agenda item 5: Conclusions and Recommendations

19. The participants reviewed, commented and approved, the draft Conclusions and Recommendations prepared by the Rapporteur, as contained in Annex III to the present reporting including as appendixes both agreed Guides.

Agenda item 6: Any Other Business

No issue was raised under this Agenda item.

Agenda item 7: Closure of the Meeting

20. The Chair in his closing remarks thanked the participants for their constructive contribution to the meeting and the Secretariat and its MED POL team for all efforts made to organize this effective and very useful meeting.

21. After the expression of usual courtesies, the Chair declared the meeting closed at 17:30 p.m. on Friday, 7 April 2017.
Annex I
List of Participants
## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position and Organization</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALBANIA / ALBANIE</td>
<td>Ms. Ledjana Bojaxhi</td>
<td>Head of Waste Management Unit, Ministry of Environment</td>
<td>Tel: +355694112110, Cell: +355694112110, Email: <a href="mailto:ledjana_k@yahoo.com">ledjana_k@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALGERIA / ALGERIE</td>
<td>Mr. Omar Alleg</td>
<td>Regional Inspector of Environment, Ministry of Water and Environment</td>
<td>Tel: +213432847, Cell: +21361321260, Fax: +213432848, Email: <a href="mailto:ireEst@yahoo.com">ireEst@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOSNIA HERZEGOVINA /</td>
<td>Ms. Selma Cengic</td>
<td>Executive Director, Hydro engineering Department, Hydro Engineering Institute Sarajevo</td>
<td>Tel: +38733207949, Cell: +38761189063, Fax: +38733207949, Email: <a href="mailto:selma.cengic@heis.ba">selma.cengic@heis.ba</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOSNIA HERZEGOVINE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CROATIA / CROATIE</td>
<td>Mr. Hrvoje Buljan</td>
<td>Ministarstvo zaštite okoliša i energetike, Radnička cesta 80, Zagreb</td>
<td>Tel: + 385 (1) 3717 178, Fax: +385 (1) 3717 135, Email: <a href="mailto:hrvoje.buljan@mzoip.hr">hrvoje.buljan@mzoip.hr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CYPRUS / CHYPRE</td>
<td>Mr. Andreas Athanasiades</td>
<td>Environmental Officer, Department of Environment, Ministry of Agriculture, Rural Development and Environment</td>
<td>Tel: +35722408935, Fax: +35722774945, Email: <a href="mailto:aathanasiades@environment.moa.gov.cy">aathanasiades@environment.moa.gov.cy</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position/Role</td>
<td>Contact Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>Mr. Mohamed Fahmi</td>
<td>Researcher Environment Impact Assessment Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agenc</td>
<td>Cell: +201223539809 Email: <a href="mailto:gemy_fahmy2000@yahoo.com">gemy_fahmy2000@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>Mr. Georgios Melekis</td>
<td>Special Secretariat for Water</td>
<td>Tel: +302106475131 Cell: +306973825305 Email: <a href="mailto:gmelekis.egy@gmail.com">gmelekis.egy@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>Mr. Ran Amir</td>
<td>Director MEPD Marine Environment Protection Division Environmental Protection Ministry of Environmental Protection</td>
<td>Tel: +97248633501 Cell: +972506233050 Fax: +97248633520 Email: <a href="mailto:rani@sviva.gov.il">rani@sviva.gov.il</a>, <a href="mailto:amirrani_2012@yahoo.com">amirrani_2012@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Rami Peleg</td>
<td>Head Investigator Marine Environment Protection Division Ministry of Environmental Protection, Israel</td>
<td>Cell: +972-05-6233005 Email: <a href="mailto:ramip@sviva.gov.il">ramip@sviva.gov.il</a>, <a href="mailto:ramipeleg@gmail.com">ramipeleg@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Mr. Francesco Andreotti</td>
<td>Environmental Inspector under IE Directive VAL-R-TEC Italian National Institute for Environmental Protection and Research (ISPRA)</td>
<td>Tel: +390650072424 Cell: +393294110852 Email: <a href="mailto:andreotti.francesco@gmail.com">andreotti.francesco@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>Ms. Marwa El Mokdad</td>
<td>Environmental Engineer Service of Urban protection Ministry of Environment - Service of Urban Protection</td>
<td>Tel: +9613037057 Email: <a href="mailto:marwamokdad@hotmail.com">marwamokdad@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LIBYA/LIBYE</strong></td>
<td>Mr. Ali Elkekli</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Technical Cooperation &amp; Consultation Environment General Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P. O. Box 83618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Ritianne Stellini</td>
<td>Senior Officer - Compliance and Enforcement</td>
<td>Compliance and Enforcement Unit Environment and Resources Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNEGRO</strong></td>
<td>Mrs. Ivana Bulatovic</td>
<td>Advisor in EPA Montenegro</td>
<td>Monitoring, Analyses and Reporting Environmental Protection Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Ivana Stojanovic</td>
<td>Adviser</td>
<td>Department for Sustainable Development and Integrated Coastal Zone Management Ministry of Sustainable Development and Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MOROCCO / MAROC</strong></td>
<td>Mr. Jawad Benhmidane</td>
<td>Chef de Service Police de l'Environnement</td>
<td>Direction de Contrôle Ministère de l'Environnement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Moulay Lahcen Ouahidi</td>
<td>Head of Department analysis of micropolluants</td>
<td>Laboratoire National des Etudes et de Surveillance de la Pollution Ministry of Energy, Mining, Water and Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position and Details</td>
<td>Contact Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Slovenia     | Mr. Boris Žbona                | Inspector for the Environment Inspectorate for Environment and Spatial Planning Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning | Tel: +38653311882  
Cell: +38631669638  
Fax: +38634252733  
Email: boris.zbona@gov.si |
| Turkey       | Mr. Muhammed Tarik Durmus     | Chemical Engineer (MSc) DG Environmental Impact Assessment Permit and Inspection Ministry of Environment and Urbanization | Tel: +903124101970  
Cell: +905364322843  
Email: mtarik.durmus@csb.gov.tr |
| Observer     |                               |                                                       |                                              |
| Palestine    | Mrs. Kahramana Al-Kelani      | Director of International Relations International Relations Environment Quality Authority | Tel: +9702403495  
Cell: +970599240215  
Fax: +9702403494  
Email: kah_kelani@yahoo.com |
|              | Mr. Ibrahim Amjad             | EIA Manager Environmental Protection Environment Quality Authority                    | Cell: +972597308647  
Fax: +97022403494  
Email: amjadibrahim69@yahoo.com |
REPRESENTATIVES OF UNITED NATIONS SPECIALIZED AGENCIES AND OTHER INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS/REPRESENTANTS DES INSTITUTIONS SPECIALISEES DES NATIONS UNIES ET AUTRES ORGANISATIONS INTERGOUVERNEMENTALES

| EUROPEAN UNION NETWORK FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION AND ENFORCEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL LAW (IMPEL) | Mr. Harald Junker  
Dipl. Ing.  
Umweltbundesamt |
|---|---|
| Tel: +4934021033045  
Cell: +491772620022  
Email: harald.junker@uba.de |
NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS
ORGANISATIONS NON-GOUVERNEMENTALES

| MEDITERRANEAN INFORMATION OFFICE FOR ENVIRONMENT, CULTURE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (MIO-ECSDE). | Ms. Anastasia Roniotes  
Head Officer  
Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIO-ECSDE)  
Tel: +302103247490  
Fax: +302103317127  
Email: info@mio-ecsde.org |
SECRETARIAT TO THE BARCELONA CONVENTION AND COMPONENTS OF THE MEDITERRANEAN ACTION PLAN
SECRETARIAT DE LA CONVENTION DE BARCELONE ET COMPOSANTES DU PLAN D’ACTION POUR LA MEDITERRANEE

| UNEP/MAP PNUE/PAM | Ms Tatjana Hema  
Deputy Coordinator  
Tel:+30 210 7273115  
E-mail: tatjana.hema@unep.org |
|-------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| CONSULTANT        | Mr. Dimitrios Tsotsos  
Tel: +306936773334  
Email: tsotsosd@gmail.com |
Annex II
Agenda of the Meeting
### Agenda of the Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda item</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Opening of the Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Adoption of the Agenda and Election of Officers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Conclusions and Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Any Other Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Closure of the meeting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex III
Conclusions and Recommendations
Conclusions and Recommendations

The Meeting of the Mediterranean Informal Network on Compliance and Enforcement was held on 6-7 April 2017, at the Club Hotel Casino Loutraki, Loutraki, Greece.

The meeting brought together national experts working in the environmental permitting and inspection systems. Following review and discussions of all agenda items, the meeting agreed on the following deliberations, conclusions and recommendations:

**Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean region**

1. Following the presentations made by all countries represented at the Meeting, it was acknowledged that important progress has been achieved in setting up and strengthening national environmental inspection systems which are operational in all Mediterranean countries.

2. Lessons learnt shared during the meeting show clear progress in ensuring effective collaboration among different inspection bodies at national level, enhancing compliance, pollution reduction; protection of endangered species.

3. The meeting highlighted that in spite of progress achieved and success stories, challenges are still considerable in particular related to a) insufficient human resources, b) needs for capacity building and enhancing technical competency of competent authorities in addressing both permitting and inspection, (i.e., risk assessment for effective inspection planning, enforcement indicators and evaluation of environmental benefits of inspections, prevention of non-compliance, shipment of waste, etc.) c) sharing best practices across the region and beyond.

4. The meeting recommended that the informal network on compliance and enforcement established under the MAP/BC should provide more opportunities for the Contracting Parties and relevant organizations to work together to enhance environmental performance and effectiveness of national enforcement bodies within the scope of the MAP Programme of work.

5. The meeting also highlighted the need for better collaboration with other enforcement networks such as IMPEL with the view to promote sharing of best practices and capacity building.

**Strengthening the Inspection and Permitting Systems to promote the use of Best Available Techniques (BAT)** (UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/3Corr.1, UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/4)

6. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat related to the application and selection of most adequate Best Available Techniques in the permitting process and appreciated its content, usefulness and practicality. The meeting suggested minor changes to ensure further clarifications such as environmental quality standards.

7. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft as contained in Appendix I to these conclusions and recommendations, to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance permitting process and competence of the national authorities ensuring that the proper BAT are selected by the operators/proponents.

8. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation.
9. The meeting recommended the following case studies to be developed by the Secretariat to address BAT assessment in the permitting system:
   a) Waste water including sludge management
   b) Landfill management
   c) Petroleum refinery (next biennium)
   d) Offshore Industry (next biennium)
   e) Electric arc furnace

10. The meeting encouraged all Contracting Parties to prepare, as appropriate, and send to the Secretariat, as appropriate case studies on BAT assessment addressing different sectors with a particular focus on those affecting marine and coastal environment with the view to demonstrate and highlight the Mediterranean success stories and promoting and sharing best practices in the region.

Guide on Inspection of Industrial Facilities
UNEP(DEPI)/MED WG.436/4)

11. The meeting reviewed the proposed guide prepared by the Secretariat related to the Best Available Techniques inspection process and suggested some changes to ensure a better streamlining of the enforcement indicators already agreed in the framework of the MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean.

12. The meeting agreed to recommend the proposed draft as contained in Appendix I to these conclusions and recommendations, to the meeting of MED POL Focal Points in May 2017 for consideration and agreement in using it as an effective tool to enhance national environmental inspection performance. The meeting recommended to add a footnote to the annexes in order to highlight that the annexes have been prepared for indicative purposes only.

13. The meeting requested the Secretariat, subject to external resources mobilization, to consider the possibility of preparing the publication of the guide in the official languages of the MAP system and support capacity building activities for its implementation including exchange of inspection officers between countries.

14. The meeting agreed and recommended that countries should consider reporting in future meetings of MAP-MED POL Network on Compliance and Enforcement in the Mediterranean, data and assessment of the performance inspection indicators and as appropriate their trends during the last years.

15. Finally the meeting also suggested to gradually extend the scope of the work of this network that may consider inspection activities related to other source of pollution such as dumping, offshore, etc., and in particular, the interaction of pollution impacts with the protection of marine and coastal biodiversity.

16. The meeting requested the Secretariat to make more visible the work undertaken by this informal network and disseminate its product by creating for example a clear link on UNEP/MAP website on enforcement and compliance

17. At the request of the Meeting it was agreed to allocate one week for any additional comments to be sent to the Secretariat.