Global Alliance to Eliminate Lead Paint/Lead Paint Alliance (LPA) Advisory Council Meeting

Wednesday 6 November 2019, 13:30 – 15:30 Geneva Time

Record of the Meeting

Participants:
Government of Colombia: Rodolfo Alarcón Mora
Government of Kenya: Faridah Were
Government of the Republic of Moldova: Iurie Pinzaru, Raisa Sircu
Government of the USA (USEPA): Walker Smith, Angela Bandemehr, Evonne Marzouk
ABA-ROLI: Amanda Rawls
IPEN: Sara Brosché
Boysen Paints: Johnson Ongking
UNEP: Jacqueline Alvarez, Desiree Narvaez, Nicoline Lavanchy, Allan Meso, Caroline Wood
WHO: Joanna Tempowski, Elena Jardan

Apologies: Chantana Padungtod (Government of Thailand); Sharunda Buchanan (US CDC); Julian Hunter (Akzo Nobel); Genon Jensen (Health and Environment Alliance); Denis Motet (European Chemicals Agency); Steve Sides (World Coatings Council);

1. Opening of the meeting
The meeting was opened by the Chair of the Advisory Group, Walker Smith (USEPA) who noted that it had been six months since the previous meeting and there was much to report.

2. Organizational matters of the work
a. Adoption of the agenda
The meeting adopted the agenda with no changes.

b. Organization of work
The Chair introduced the organization of the work.
3. Review of progress in implementing the Business Plan of the Global Alliance


Kenya: Faridah Were announced that excellent progress regarding the Paints and Allied Products Standards had been made in the East Africa Community Partner States (Uganda, Kenya, Tanzania, Burundi, Rwanda and Sudan). These standards now set maximum total lead content of 90 ppm throughout the East Africa Community. The next stage was implementation and enforcement of the legal limit of lead in paint at the national level. To promote this, awareness raising activities were carried out during the International Lead Poisoning Prevention Week (ILPPW). This included a presentation on the “Priorities and Progress on Lead Paint Elimination in the East Africa Region” during the Technical Committee Workshop on Paints and Allied Products Standard held in Burundi which generated interest in the region. In addition, some post-graduate students were doing research on the lead concentration of automotive and household paints on the Kenyan Market to determine the levels of compliance.

Republic of Moldova: Raisa Sircu reported that Moldova attended the SAICM GEF lead paint project Regional Workshop for Central and Eastern Europe (March 2019) and had developed their country approach document and action plan. Planned actions included: drafting a regulation and setting up an enforcement mechanism; updating the methods of determination of lead compounds in paints; adopting a procedure for testing lead in paints; awareness raising among producers and consumers and capacity building activities.

During the ILPPW a round table was organized with representatives from the Ministry of Agriculture, Regional Development and Environment, NGOs and paint retailers and manufacturers. Participants agreed on drafting the regulation to phase out lead in paints based on the National Strategy on Elimination of Lead in Paint and the LPA Model Law, with the support of key partners. There was also a seminar with importers, retailers, paint manufacturers to prepare them for a future law. Discussions included: the prohibition of the addition of lead to paints; reformulation costs; customs control on imported paints; preparatory steps that should be taken by enterprises to implement the proposed legal requirements; the need to arrange laboratory testing for compliance and enforcement of the Regulation. There were also mass media presentations on lead and lead poisoning. The LPA customizable materials were used.

Ms Sircu also reported that the development of a regulation to limit lead in paint will be included in the annual workplan of the Ministry of Health, Labour and Social Protection. The aim is to a draft Health Regulation on the elimination of lead from paints in the Republic of Moldova in 2020.

USEPA: Angela Bandemehr summarized the contributions of USEPA to the implementation of the SAICM GEF lead paint project, including project coordination activities, participation in regional workshops and organizing a sub-regional workshop in Tbilisi (described below). In addition, USEPA had provided comments and advice to the Governments of South Africa and Rwanda on new lead paint regulations, as well as providing comments on the Eurasian Economic Union revised technical standard for paints. USEPA also provides materials for ILPPW, leads the production of the LPA newsletter and the production of the UNEP global status update on countries with lead paint laws.

Colombia: Rodolfo Alarcón Mora reported that Colombia had completed a GEG lead paint project country approach document, carried out an analysis of the decorative paint market in Colombia, and developed two guidelines. One was a guidance document for government authorities, in which inter-
Institutional work areas were proposed with the aim of reducing and eliminating lead in decorative paints. The second concerned paint manufacturing, including alternatives to lead and hazard communication on product labels. Mr Alarcón also mentioned voluntary technical standards to reduce heavy metals in paints and a Ministry of Health resolution (Resolution 686/2018) that establishes a technical regulation for toys and children’s accessories, including control of the lead content. In addition, since 2010 there has been a programme for the collection and recycling of lead and lead-containing products, including used lead acid batteries. During the ILPPW, an inter-sectorial roundtable with government agencies, NGOs and industry was conducted where all participants agreed to draft a law on lead paint based on the model law by 2020. The development of the lead paint law will be included in the Ministry of Labour work plan.

**IPEN:** Sara Brosch highlighted three areas of activity. Regarding lead paint regulation, IPEN works to promote the adoption of regulations and conducts market studies to check compliance. IPEN is advocating for the regulation of all paints, including industrial paints as these can be a source of exposure to children e.g. when used on playground equipment. A recent study by an IPEN participating organization had found high levels of lead in paint on playground equipment – this has resulted in action being taken by the governments of Malaysia and Thailand. Furthermore, IPEN has found that industrial paints containing lead can be bought online with no controls.

IPEN participating organizations held many events during the ILPPW, including to highlight the issues mentioned above. Information can be found on the IPEN website ([https://ipen.org/projects/eliminating-lead-paint](https://ipen.org/projects/eliminating-lead-paint)).

**ABA-ROLI:** Amanda Rawls reported that ABA-ROLI is the legal advisor for the SAICM GEF lead paint project and has participated in all the project regional workshops. ABA-ROLI has already started some legal review of lead paint laws (regulations or standards) for South Africa, Rwanda and the Eurasian Economic Union. ABA-ROLI is carrying out an assessment of the European Union REACH regulation in comparison with the Model Law approach with a 90 ppm limit.

ABA-ROLI has participated in the compliance conversation webinars organized by the International Network for Environmental Compliance and Enforcement (INECE) on how the Model Law could be optimized to address compliance challenges. ABA-ROLI is supporting coordination of the SAICM GEF project through the development of an information sharing platform.

**Paint industry:** Johnson Ongking from Boysen reported that a representative had participated in the SAICM GEF lead paint project regional workshop for Asia-Pacific. He noted that there was still a shortage of the organic yellow pigment that could be used as an alternative to lead chromate. The price had doubled, and this was a hurdle for manufacturers wishing to phase out the use of lead.

**WHO:** Joanna Tempowski noted that WHO was very much involved in SAICM GEF project activities, working in particular with ministries of health. The main activities would be reported against other agenda items.
b. New LPA partners in 2019

Ms Tempowski (WHO) reported that 14 new partners were admitted to the Alliance in 2019. Of these there were four governments (Burkina Faso, Colombia, Madagascar and Viet Nam), there was one IGO (International Labour Organization), eight new NGO members, mostly IPEN participating organizations, and one new industry partner, a paint research and development company from the USA.


Ms Tempowski (WHO) reported on the ILPPW held from 20 to 26 October 2019. As in previous years, a range of campaign materials were developed by the Lead Paint Alliance. This was coordinated by USEPA which also provided the overall design of materials. Most of the materials were available in the 6 UN languages and they were disseminated through the WHO website. The resource package, which provides guidance on how to conduct a campaign and key messages on lead paint, was updated, as were the WHO Q&As and fact sheet. A video message in English, French and Spanish from the Director of the Department of Public Health, Environmental and Social Determinants of Health was published. In addition, a WHO video animation was produced for social media in English, French, Spanish and Russian. A total of 89 events were registered on the WHO campaign registration webpage, involving 81 organizations and held in 57 countries (updated information as at December 2019). The most active regions were Africa, the Americas and Europe. NGOs held the most events, with governments being the next largest category. Academia, industry and IGOs also organized the events.

Ms Bandemehr (USEPA) added that EPA communicated using social media, getting around 56,000 impressions of tweets sent before and during the ILPPW 2019.

d. Status of pending laws

i. Updating the WHO Global Health Observatory (GHO)

Ms Tempowski (WHO) reported that WHO has been conducting a new survey of countries to update the database on the status of legally binding controls on lead paint in countries. The survey has been sent to SAICM GEF lead paint project focal points and SAICM national focal points. In addition, information has been extracted from the country approach documents sent by countries participating in the SAICM GEF lead paint project. The survey replies are still being received and the data will be used to update the GHO and the UNEP global status update. The current figure for countries with lead paint laws is 73. The aim is to update the GHO early next year.

ii. Overview on the Global Status Report 2019

Ms Bandemehr (USEPA) noted that the development of this report is a contribution of USEPA to the LPA, using the data from the WHO database and published by UNEP. Some countries have confirmed that they do not have laws and two countries have reported new laws (Bangladesh, Israel). In addition, Jordan has revised its lead limit from 600 to 90 ppm. A Spanish version of the global update is also available.

In the general discussion, it was noted that the database of countries does not systematically include information about the scope and content of the lead paint laws to see how well they align with the Model Law. This is something that could be considered for the future. A question was also asked about
tracking the link between the conduct of spot checks on paint and the adoption of lead paint laws. While there is currently no tracking as such, Ms Brosché (IPEN) noted that when IPEN does follow-up studies in countries that have implemented lead paint laws the proportion of paints with high lead concentrations has generally decreased. More systematic tracking should be considered as it was felt that having data that showed laws being effective would encourage other countries to act.

4. Project and activities

a. SAICM GEF project lead paint component

i. Overall project progress to date

Desiree Narvaez (UNEP) recalled that the Chemicals and Health Branch has the dual role as co-secretariat for LPA and coordinating the lead paint component on SAICM GEF project. She presented an overview of progress to date with the two project components: 1.1 addressing SME paint manufacturers and 1.2 addressing legal and advocacy support. Further details are provided in two meeting documents (appended).

ii. Regional activities (UNEP, WHO)

Ms Narvaez (UNEP) noted that all the four regional workshops had been held. Workshop participants were 41 from Ministries of Environment, 31 from Ministries of Health, 34 from civil society, and 6 from industry, totalling to 112. Lead executing partners for priority countries in the Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) region, Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean and the Asia-Pacific regions had been identified. UNEP had appointed regional consultants for the first three of these regions.

Ms Tempowski (WHO) went to all the regional workshops. Of the 77 countries invited to participate in the project, there were 52 responses from ministries of health and this could still increase. At the workshops a recurring request was for the health and scientific justification for a 90 ppm limit on lead in paint to be explained. To that end, WHO was in process for developing a technical briefing document to provide this information.

Others who had attended workshops gave their reflections. The workshops revealed the variation between countries with respect to their legal or regulatory procedures and which institutions would be involved. In some countries the lead agency was not clear. For CEE countries it was important to make a persuasive case to Parliament that lead paint was a problem in the country. The importance of engaging with multiple stakeholders was emphasized and the roles of NGOs and industry were highlighted. The regional workshops had provided an opportunity for these different stakeholders to get acquainted. It was also helpful to share information from countries that had successfully implemented lead paint laws.

Another recurring topic was the need for access to laboratories for compliance testing. While the Model Law puts the onus on manufacturers to obtain declarations of conformity using third party testing, some countries expressed a wish to develop their own laboratory capacities or to have information about available laboratories. It was also noted that lack of laboratories should not be a barrier to establishing a law, since there are many existing laboratories. Jacqueline Alvarez (UNEP) described a new project to survey laboratories across the globe to compile a voluntary databank of laboratories that could measure the lead content in paint.
A key reflection was the need to keep up the momentum in countries to adopt lead paint laws. It was suggested that countries did not fully understand how the project advisors could help them so proactive follow-up was needed, particularly when countries submitted their plans. WHO and UNEP were asked to encourage senior officials in their organizations to include lead paint in their discussions with countries.

### iii. Central and Eastern Europe Sub-Regional workshop

Ms Bandemehr (USEPA) reported on this workshop, which took place on 11–12 September 2019 in Tbilisi, Georgia organized by the US Department of Commerce. Five countries participated, with representatives from ministries of industry as well as health and environment. This included the Chair of the Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU) technical committee discussing the revised the technical regulation on lead paint. An outcome of this was that project advisors were given the opportunity to provide comments on the draft EAEU technical regulation.

### iii. SME Support activities

Ms Narvaez (UNEP) reported on the draft paint reformulation guidelines being developed under the SAICM GEF project. These have been developed by the National Cleaner Production Centre (NCPC) of Serbia and are ready for use in the pilot demonstration projects with SMEs. The final draft technical guidelines on paint reformulation is planned to be launched at the 5th International Conference on Chemicals Management (ICCM5) in Bonn, Germany in early October 2020.

Ms Brosché (IPEN) reported that projects with paint manufacturer associations in Indonesia and Nigeria will start early in 2020.

### b. Communication and outreach

#### i. Website and the newsletter

Ms Narvaez (UNEP) reported on the status of the UNEP website and noted that all the information relating to the regional workshops had been uploaded on the SAICM website. The development of FAQs was under discussion. It was noted that the knowledge management component of the SAICM GEF project will provide another platform for sharing information, for example case studies of countries that enacted lead paint laws and an interactive toolkit. This platform will be made available in early 2020, before the fourth meeting of the intersessional process (IP4) of SAICM that will take place from 23 to 27 March in Bucharest, Romania.

Caroline Wood (UNEP) reported that two newsletters had been published in 2019: a full newsletter in June and a short one in October. These were developed with the assistance of USEPA. There was a high rate of opening by recipients - further details are provided in the appended meeting document. New subscribers are welcome and can register for the newsletter at [https://unenvironment.us19.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=870822f9bddd9f5c20d7186411&id=9d8c9ba745](https://unenvironment.us19.list-manage.com/subscribe?u=870822f9bddd9f5c20d7186411&id=9d8c9ba745). Advisory Council members are also invited to provide items for the newsletter, for example information about recent activities or achievements on lead paint.

Ms Tempowski (WHO) reported that WHO is updating the brief guides to analytical methods for measuring lead in paint and in blood. The technical briefing document referred to above summarizes the health and economic arguments for a lead paint law and provides the justification for the 90 ppm limit.
When finalized the document will be translated and a short version as a policy brief will also be produced.

Nicoline Lavanchy (UNEP) highlighted the role of social media in promoting action on lead paint. Details of Twitter activities on the SAICM account are appended.

**ii. Webinars**

USEPA has facilitated the organization of two webinars hosted by the International Network for Environmental Compliance and Enforcement (INECE) in which Lead paint Alliance partners have given presentations. There are plans to organize other technical webinars on various topics around lead paint testing and lead paint laws.

5. Any other business

Ms Were (Kenya) asked about alternatives to lead chromate for road markings that paint manufacturers would find cost-effective. Mr Ongking (Boysen) stated that the same pigments could be used as in other decorative coatings, though he noted again the current shortage. Mr Ongking could provide the names of pigment manufacturers. Ms Brosché stated that NCPC Jordan had a relevant case study involving a local company that made road paint, which could provide useful information.

Ms Were also mentioned face paints, which can also contain lead pigments. Others noted that high levels of lead in face paints had been found in India, Thailand and the USA.

6. Closure the meeting

The next meeting would take place in May 2020. Ms Smith, as Chair, thanked the Advisory Council members for their contributions and closed the meeting.